

**City Council Meeting  
City of Bethel, Alaska  
Regular Meeting  
January 23, 2018**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

A Regular Meeting of the Bethel City Council was held on January 23, 2018 at 6:30 p.m., in the council chambers, Bethel, Alaska.

Mayor Richard Robb called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

**II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**III. ROLL CALL**

<b>Comprising a quorum of the Council, the following members were present:</b>	
Mayor Rick Robb	Council Member Mark Springer (Telephonically)
Vice-Mayor Fred Watson	Council Member Leif Albertson (Telephonically)
Council Member Naim Shabani	Council Member Thor Williams
Council Member Mitchell Forbes	
<b>Members Absent:</b>	
<b>Also in attendance were the following:</b>	
City Manager Pete Williams	Assistant City Clerk Kevin Morgan
City Attorney Patty Burley	

**Main Motion:** Move Special Order Of Business Item "A" to front of agenda.

Moved by:	Williams
Seconded by:	Shabani
Action:	Motion carries by a vote of 7-0
In favor:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Robb <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Albertson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Watson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Springer <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Shabani <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Williams <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Forbes
Opposed:	-0

**SPECIAL ORDER OF BUSINESS**

**Item A** – City of Bethel Proclamation: Recognizing The Bethel Warriors Wrestling Team In Their Division II State Championship Title.

#### **IV. PEOPLE TO BE HEARD**

Mary Nanuwak- Would like to apologize to the Council. She made assumptions about the council which turned out not to be true. Quyana cakeq to the City of Bethel and presented a letter to the Council. She opposes any alcohol such as, Ordinance 17-48 and Resolution 18-02. Does not think alcohol is the answer to the region as a money making tool. It causes primary effects to the users and as well as secondary effects to other people. Saddened to hear about the death of a lost person who called 911 and didn't get help. She felt that if the emergency system had less alcohol calls, they might have had more time to deal with serious emergencies like that one.

Eileen Arnold- Executive Director-Tundra Women's Collation (TWC)- Thanked Council for listening to their concerns. Would like to see action toward sales tax exemptions for non-profits. Listed examples of ways TWC has directly helped the City of Bethel and wondered if in-kind donations could be used as a tax credit toward taxes that the city collects

Susan Murphy, Parish Administrator for the Catholic Church- spoke in favor of sales tax exemption for non-profits. Would like options from the City for non-profits to have a different way to pay sales tax that isn't a administrative burden to process as most small non-profits do not have the time or workers to deal with additional administrative office work. Perhaps tax business who make over a certain amount every year, or exempt businesses who make less than a certain amount every year.

Chariton Epchook- Supports Resolution 18-01, forming a task force. Talked about the negative effects of alcohol on the youth. Talked about the need of alcohol education and its impact.

Mike Williams- Spoke in favor of Task force Resolution 18-01. Feels problems associated with alcohol abuse are solvable. Believes the task force is a good way of starting the conversation toward finding solutions. Would like the local villages to have input in it as well. Liquor stores cause a lot of stress in our communities and are increasing social problems.

Ivan Ivan- Chief of Akiak Native community- Supports Resolution 18-01. Commends the Council for their leadership on this issue. It is important for older people to find ways to help the youth. Feels the resolution is an important step to do this.

David E. Trantham Jr.- Respectfully requests the city to start to issue statistics between illegal sales and legal sales of alcohol. Would like to see if the

negative effects are coming from legal sales. Respectfully, requests council to consider striking the words like "problem" and replace it with "Alcohol misuse" and listed other examples. Does not want the mayor to be in charge of the task force, and would like an appointee.

Lorin Bradbury- Rental owner- Supports Introduction and Adoption of Ordinance 17-46. Doesn't think that Council Member Shabani and Albertson have a conflict of interest as it applies to the tenant. Believes that tenants will become a different class of people as they will be paying 12% instead of 6% sales tax. Disagreed with the City Attorney's prior point of view on this matter as an equal protection issue. Believed it was not equal protection for the tenant.

David Salzburn- Agrees with Lorin Bradbury concerning Ordinance 17-46.

Jeffery Evon- Concerned with the growing amount of traffic in the housing area due to the Liquor store. There is a high amount of children in the area. There are intoxicated people in the surrounding area. Listed unsafe examples of children encountering and being harassed by intoxicated people.

## V. APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT AND REGULAR AGENDA

**Main Motion:** Approve the Consent and Regular Agenda.

Moved by:	Springer
Seconded by:	Shabani
Action:	Motion carries by a vote of 7-0
In favor:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Robb <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Albertson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Watson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Springer <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Shabani <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Williams <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Forbes
Opposed:	-0

**Primary Amendment:** Postpone Item D of New Business: Resolution 18-02.

Moved by:	Springer
Seconded by:	Forbes
Action:	Motion does not carry by a vote of 2-5
In favor:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Albertson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Springer
Opposed:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Robb <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Watson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Shabani <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Williams <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Forbes

**Primary Amendment:** Move Item E of New Business to precede Item D in New Business.

Moved by:	Forbes
Seconded by:	Williams
Action:	Motion carries by a vote of 7-0
In favor:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Robb <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Albertson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Watson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Springer <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Shabani <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Williams <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Forbes
Opposed:	-0

**Removal from**

**Consent:** Item D from New Business: Resolution 18-02.

Moved by: | Robb

**Removal from** Items A, B, C in New Business: Introduction Of Budget Ordinance 17-28(g),

**Consent:** Introduction Of Budget Ordinance 17-28(h), Resolution 18-01.

Moved by: | Williams

**Primary**

**Amendment:** Postpone Healthfitness Monthly Report to the next meeting.

Moved by: Forbes

Seconded by: Shabani

Action: Motion carries by a vote of 7-0

In favor:  Robb  Albertson  Watson  Springer  Shabani  Williams  Forbes

Opposed: -0

*Council Member Springer leaves at 7:27 pm*

**VI. APPROVAL OF THE MEETING MINUTES**

**Item A** – 1-9-2018 Regular Meeting Minutes.

*Passed on the Consent Agenda*

**Item B** – 1-9-2018 Special Meeting Minutes

*Passed on the Consent Agenda*

**VII. REPORTS OF STANDING COMMITTEES**

**Public Safety and Transportation Commission**

Next meeting will be February 7<sup>th</sup>.

**Port Commission**

Last Meeting was on January 15<sup>th</sup>. Three members were present. Did not establish quorum

**Planning Commission**

Last Meeting was January 11<sup>th</sup>. Kathy Hanson was re-elected chair. Lorin Bradbury was elected vice-chair. Spoke about the AVCP windmill, and Blue Sky as upcoming items

**Parks, Recreation, Aquatic Health and Safety Center Committee**

Next meeting is February 12<sup>th</sup> at 6:00 pm. No meeting since last meeting.

Kasayuli and Phase 2 are on the next meeting. Invites the public to attend and be part of the conversation.

**Finance Committee**

Committee Member Trantham reported that the meeting was not held due to no quorum.

**Energy Committee**

No one to report.

**Public Works Committee**

Currently there is only one member. No quorum can be established.

**VIII. SPECIAL ORDER OF BUSINESS**

**Item A** – City of Bethel Proclamation: Recognizing The Bethel Warriors Wrestling Team In Their Division II State Championship Title.

**Item B** – Health Fitness Monthly Report.

*Postponed*

**IX. UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

**Item A** – Public Hearing of Ordinance 17-48: Amending Fees And Charges Related To Alcohol Permit Applications And Major Subdivision Development.

*Mayor Robb opened the Public Hearing.*

David E. Trantham Jr.- Did not approve of the large tax increase of the Conditional Use Permit for Alcohol and did not approve of the special event permit fee. He would like to see fiscal notes with the appropriate signatures in the packet.

Lorin Bradbury- Wanted clarification of what events are included under "Special Events". Feels that the City is renegeing on community events and wants to know if this fee pertains only to events involving alcohol.

Mary Nanuwak- Asked council to sign the documents included in the packet to protect the city from litigation and to look more professional.

*Mayor Robb closed the Public Hearing.*

**Main Motion:** Mayor Robb called for a vote in the adoption of Ordinance 17-48.

---

Action:	Motion carries by a vote of 5-1
In favor:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Albertson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Watson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Shabani <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Williams <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Forbes
Opposed:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Robb

**Item B – Public Hearing Of Budget Ordinance 17-28(f):** Amending The Fiscal Year 2018 Budget To Move Funds From Finance Salaries To Auditing Expenses And Other Professional Services.

*Mayor Robb opened the Public Hearing.*

*David E. Trantham Jr.- Concerned if anyone connected to the city violated their oath of office And is concerned that payments are being made after the fact. Noted the signatures on the summary/fiscal note. Would prefer that the City used supporting documents, that are included with this ordinance, as an example for future ordinances.*

*Mary Nanuwak- Had a question of why FY 2018 audit funds are being moved to Professional Services. Would like to know what the other professional services are.*

*Mayor Robb closed the Public Hearing.*

---

**Main Motion:** Adopt Budget Ordinance 17-28(f).

Moved by:	Forbes
Seconded by:	Albertson
Action:	Motion does not carry by a vote of 2-4
In favor:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Robb <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Albertson
Opposed:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Watson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Shabani <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Williams <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Forbes

**Item C – Introduction Of Ordinance 17-46:** Amending The Bethel Municipal Code Chapter 4.16.160 Tax Exemptions Rental Units Tax Exemption On Fuel And Electricity.

*Mayor Robb previously ruled that Council Member Shabani and Council Member Albertson have a conflict of interest on this issue. They did not contest the previous ruling and did not take part in the discussion or voting. Council Member Shabani left the Chambers.*

---

**Main Motion:** Introduce Ordinance 17-46.

Moved by:	Watson
Seconded by:	Forbes
Action:	Motion carries by a vote of 4-0
In favor:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Robb <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Watson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Williams <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Forbes
Opposed:	-0

*10 minute recess declared by the chair.*

*Council Member Shabani returned to the meeting. Council Member Albertson re-joined telephonically.*

## **X. NEW BUSINESS**

**Item A – Introduction of Budget Ordinance 17-28(g):** Amending The Adopted Annual FY 2018 Budget- Professional Fees-H-Marker Lake Road.

<b>Main Motion:</b>	Introduce Budget Ordinance 17-28 (g)
Moved by:	Williams
Seconded by:	Forbes
Action:	Postponed indefinitely
<b>Subsidiary Motion:</b>	Postpone indefinitely
Moved by:	Shabani
Seconded by:	Forbes
Action:	Motion carries by a vote of 6-0
In favor:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Robb <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Albertson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Watson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Shabani <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Williams <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Forbes
Opposed:	-0

**Item B – Introduction of Budget Ordinance 17-28(h):** Amending The Adopted Annual FY 2018 Budget-Change To Leased Properties - Court Complex Fund.

<b>Main Motion:</b>	Introduce Budget Ordinance 17-28(h)
Moved by:	Forbes
Seconded by:	Williams
Action:	Motion carries by a vote of 6-0
In favor:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Robb <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Albertson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Watson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Shabani <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Williams <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Forbes
Opposed:	-0

**Item C – Resolution 18-01:** Forming A Task Force To Provide Advice On Mitigation Of Alcohol Problems in the Community and Region.

<b>Main Motion:</b>	Adopt Resolution 18-01.
Moved by:	Forbes
Seconded by:	Shabani
Action:	Motion carries by a vote of 6-0
In favor:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Robb <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Albertson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Watson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Shabani <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Williams <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Forbes
Opposed:	-0

**Item E – Review Administrative Report For AC Quickstop Package Store License Renewal.**

*Council reviewed the Administrative Report.*

**Item D – Resolution 18-02:** Providing Support With Conditions, Of Package Store Liquor License #5418 Renewal For AC Quickstop, Located At 131 Akakeek St., Owned By The North West Company (International) Inc.

- i. AC Quickstop Opportunity To Defend Per 3 AAC 304.145

*Council Member Forbes declared a conflict of interest, regarding a local option petition that he is sponsoring. Mayor Robb asked Council Member Forbes if he could be fair and impartial. Council Member Forbes answered in the affirmative. Mayor Robb ruled that he does not have a financial conflict or another conflict of interest.*

*Katie Davies, Legal representation from the NorthWest Company international, and Walter Pickett, Director/Vice President, from the NorthWest Company (U.S.) addressed the council telephonically.*

**Main Motion:** Adopt Resolution 18-02.

Moved by:	Forbes
Seconded by:	Williams
Action:	Postponed

**Subsidiary Motion:** Postpone until next meeting.

Moved by:	Williams
Seconded by:	Forbes
Action:	Motion carries by a vote of 5-1
In favor:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Robb <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Watson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Shabani <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Williams <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Forbes
Opposed:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Albertson

**Item F – AM 18-06: Direct City Administration To Prepare And Submit The Application For The 2018 Volunteer Fire Assistance Grant.**

**Main Motion:** Approve AM 18-06.

Moved by:	Forbes
Seconded by:	Williams
Action:	Motion carries by a vote of 6-0
In favor:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Robb <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Albertson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Watson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Shabani <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Williams <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Forbes
Opposed:	-0

**Item G – AM 18-07: Appointment of Scott J. Campbell to the Planning Commission as an Alternate Member for a term of three years.**

*Passed on the consent agenda.*

**Item H – IM 18-01: Monthly Financial Reports July- November.**

*Council Reviewed the Information Memorandum.*

- XI. MAYOR'S REPORT**
- XII. MANAGER'S REPORT**
- XIII. CLERK'S REPORT**

#### **XIV. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS**

Mayor Richard Robb – Congratulated the K300 Committee, Pete Kaiser and all the volunteers. Congratulated the Bethel Warrior State Champions and Coach Lieb and other volunteers like Council Member Williams who were part of the team. Wants people to be safe in the cold. The Federal Government is making important choices now that may help our state in the future. Wishes the Alaskan State Legislature to work fast on solving our states problems.

Vice-Mayor Fred Watson – no comments

Council Member Leif Albertson – no comments

Council Member Naim Shabani – Congratulated the K300 Race Committee and volunteers. Congratulated Pete Kaiser for his 4<sup>th</sup> win. Thanked all the sewer and water workers that are out there doing their job in the extremely cold weather.

Council Member Thor Williams– Stated that one of the best things about this community is the youth. Thanked council for recognizing the Bethel Warrior Wrestling Team. Would like more examples like this in community. Thanked the K300 Race Committee for having a successful race despite adverse conditions.

Council Member Mitchell Forbes– Thanked all the members of the public who attended and participated in tonight’s meeting. Thanked all the committee members.

#### **XV. EXECUTIVE SESSION**

**Item A**– In Accordance With AS 44.62.310(c)2: Subjects That Tend To Prejudice The Reputation And Character Of Any Person, Provided The Person May Request A Public Discussion - Evaluation, City Manager.

**Item B**– In Accordance With AS 44.62.310(c)1: Matters, The Immediate Knowledge Of Which Would Clearly Have An Adverse Effect Upon The Finances Of The Public Entity- Court House Leased Property Contract.

Move Into Executive Session-

Item A– In Accordance With AS 44.62.310(c)2: Subjects That Tend To Prejudice The Reputation And Character Of Any Person, Provided The Person May Request A Public Discussion - Evaluation, City Manager. Those attending Item A were: City Council for the first part. City Manager and Council for the second part.

Item B– In Accordance With AS 44.62.310(c)1: Matters, The Immediate Knowledge Of Which Would Clearly Have An Adverse Effect Upon The Finances Of The Public Entity- Court House Leased Property Contract. Those attending Item B were: City Manager, City Attorney, and City Council.

**Main Motion:**

---

---

Moved by:	Williams
Seconded by:	Shabani
Action:	Motion carries by a vote of 6-0
In favor:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Robb <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Albertson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Watson <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Shabani <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Williams <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Forbes
Opposed:	0

*Council Member Watson left the meeting at 11:35 p.m.  
Council Member Albertson left the meeting prior to adjournment.*

## **XVI. ADJOURNMENT**

**Main Motion:** Adjournment.

---

Moved by:	Williams
Seconded by:	Forbes
Action:	Motion carries by a vote of 4-0
In favor:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Robb <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Shabani <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Williams <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Forbes
Opposed:	0

*Council adjourned at 11:50 p.m.*



Richard Robb, Mayor

ATTEST:



---

Kevin Morgan, Assistant City Clerk